

United States Court of Appeals  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

---

**No. 14-5004**

**September Term, 2014**

**1:13-cv-00851-RJL  
1:13-cv-00881-RJL**

**Filed On: November 4, 2014 [1520472]**

Larry Elliott Klayman, et al.,

Appellees

v.

Barack Hussein Obama, et al.,

Appellants

Roger Vinson,

Appellee

---

Consolidated with 14-5005, 14-5016, 14-5017

**BEFORE:** Circuit Judge Brown, and Senior Circuit Judges Williams and Sentelle

**COURTROOM MINUTES OF ORAL ARGUMENT**

PROCLAMATION BEING MADE, the Court opened on November 4, 2014 at 9:32 a.m. The cause was heard as case No. 1 of 3 and argued before the Court by:

H. Thomas Byron, III (DOJ), counsel for Appellants.

Larry Klayman, counsel for Appellees.

Cindy Cohn, counsel for Amici Curiae Electronic Frontier Foundation, et al.

Paul M. Smith, counsel for Amici Curie Center for NSS.

**FOR THE COURT:**  
Mark J. Langer, Clerk

BY: /s/  
Shana E. Thurman  
Deputy Clerk